

## Evaluation of Factors Influencing Organizational Effectiveness of Textile Exporting Firms

Aftab Ahmad<sup>1</sup>, Khalid Jamil<sup>2</sup>, Rana Faizan Gul<sup>2</sup>, Aliya Anwar<sup>2</sup>, Shagufta Yasmin<sup>3</sup>

### Abstract

Organizational effectiveness is vital component to satisfy the clients and the textile sector is not exempted in this context. This study focuses on examining the organizational effectiveness of textile exporting firms of Pakistan. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to examine the effectiveness of these firms based on different indicators such as; effectiveness, transparency and marketing practices of the committees. The data sources for this study were compiled from preliminary data from a sample of 377 senior management employees. The research population selected for the study is the management cadre of those textile firms who manufacture products for exports. This study has many contributions for the managers and clients who are associated with textile exports. The findings significantly support the hypothesis of a positive relationship between transparency and effectiveness of the firms and the positive relationship between the board performance and efficiency of the firms. However, it is established that the positive correlation hypothesis between marketing practices and the effectiveness of the firm has insignificant results.

**Keywords:** *Textile Exporting Firms; Transparency; Board Performance; Marketing Practices; Pakistan.*

### 1 Introduction

This study focuses on investigation of effectiveness of textile exporting firms in Pakistan; hence the aim of this study is to investigate what would be the factors influencing the firms' effectiveness in Pakistan. Murtaza, Shad, Shahzad, Shah, and Khan (2011) have stated that complaints about the inefficiency and ineffectiveness of firms have been rising. In addition, many studies have been done on textile sector in Pakistan, however very limited studies have been conducted to investigate the effectiveness of exporting firms (Ijaz, Mahar, Siyal, & Anjum, 2018). Studies on textile exports in Pakistan are limited to financial management practices and financial reporting (Ejaz, Naeem, Shahmim, Elahi, & Khan, 2016). Therefore, there is a need for the expansion in the scope of firm effectiveness that would facilitate stake holders in decision making prior to provide income to the firm.

<sup>1</sup>Department of Electrical Engineering, NFC Institute of Engineering and Fertilizers Research, Faisalabad, Pakistan

<sup>2</sup>chool of Economics and Management, North China Electric Power University, Beijing 102206, PR China

<sup>3</sup>epartment of Education, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, University of Management and Technology, Lahore, Pakistan

Corresponding Author: [aftabahmadrao@gmail.com](mailto:aftabahmadrao@gmail.com)

According to (Lee, 2016) good board governance and internal control policies in organizations are important to hinder or minimize the negative effects of fraudulent activities in the organization. Effective boards enable firms to minimize fraudulent cases which subsequently would improve firm's performance. However, there are studies shows that frauds happen in firms of all sizes and in every place of the country and the cost due to frauds are increasing dramatically. According to Association of Certified Fraud Examiners, 2014 report to the Nation on Occupational Fraud and Abuse, in a 2014 study of 508 occupational fraud cases, 12.2% of the frauds happened in the textile sector. The average loss of cases in textile organizations was \$100,000, up from \$40,000 in a similar study in 2012. The billing schemes were the most common form of fraud in textile sector organizations, which contributed 46.6% of the cases. It shows clearly that, there is an issue with the board effectiveness, which becomes one of the factors, causes fraudulent cases rising in textile sector.

Over the last three decades, there was a remarkable growth in the number of textile sector (Pope, Isely, & Asamo-Tutu, 2009). This has caused more competition due to an inadequate amount of funds provided by the government, corporations, and foundations to organizations (Bilal & Sial, 2017). Therefore, to address this problem, textile sector organizations have realized the importance of marketing and in the marketing profession as a whole. From the research conducted by (Brady, Brace-Govan, Brennan, & Conduit, 2011), textile sector organizations have experienced tremendous transformation and facing a lot of pressures from outside environment which includes government, international and domestic influence and causes the changes in lifestyles of volunteers in terms of their availability and competition considerations (Bennett & Sargeant, 2005). Therefore, in order to withstand these changes many textile sector organizations have practiced marketing in their organization management (Bennett & Savani, 2004).

This study focused on transparency, board performance and marketing practices which create organizational effectiveness of textile firms. This study explain that these three factors could allow organization to take decision without fearing any protocol. This practice might improve organizational effectiveness through their spontaneous acts. In being transparent, organization do not have any practice to be concealed from their own members or from the public. Since they can present and communicate information as the way it existing, there is possibility of offering service with high effectiveness.

## **2 Literature Review**

### **2.1 Transparency**

In many countries, organizations are required to maintain a basic level of transparency through mandatory disclosure of financial information or other records, for example through the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) forms 990 and 990-PF in the United States (Striebing, 2017). The concept of transparency has not received much academic attention, so it is difficult to define and measure (Villena & Dhanorkar, 2020). The 2017 Miriam-Webster Dictionary defines transparency as "without hypocrisy or fraud". Or "easily visible", "easily understood" and "the nature of visibility or access to information, especially in relation to business operations.

According to the research by Heimstädt and Dobusch (2020), transparency in textile sector organizations can be defined as the opportunity of external stakeholders to access organization-specific details. For example, the researchers quoted transparency about the textile sector organization's operations in order to make decisions. The research also found that textile sector organizations that are large, have more debt and have bigger contribution ratio are more transparent in allowing access to their audited version financial statements.

Transparency in textile sector organizations described in the study (Greiling, Harris, & Stanley, 2016) as the act of displaying the resources used. Gandia (2011) stated that transparency in textile sector organizations is displaying the use of dispersed income for the public view. According to the research by Samuels (2021), transparency in textile sector organizations can be measured through unidirectional information disclosure and communication within the stakeholders. The description implies that transparency is measured based on the amount of unidirectional information disclosed to the members of textile sector organization and the public and the extent of communication among the stakeholders.

Chen et al. (2018) reported that textile sector organizations' transparency is best measured through their expense reporting. According to the author of this study, transparency is evaluated by monitoring how the textile sector organization dispersing net income.

## **2.2 Board Performance**

Competent government organizations and trusted partners depend not only on the skills of managers, employees and volunteers in these organizations. It also depends on the determination and skills of the director. There are studies supporting the hypothesis that the effectiveness of the committee is related to the implementation of certain guidelines of the committee, and some studies support the hypothesis that the effectiveness of the committee contributes to the overall effectiveness of public organizations. In addition, Bradshaw, Murray, and Wolpin (1992) study the relationship between board performance and organizational performance by developing a conceptual framework that includes multiple variables used to evaluate performance. On the board, the authors begin by examining the impact that committee practices have on stakeholders' perceptions of committee effectiveness. The authors found that guidelines related to stakeholders' perceptions of board performance included strategic planning, maintaining a shared vision, and applying good practice in organizing meetings. Finally, the authors suggest that there is an important link between stakeholders' perceptions of board performance and organizational efficiency. In another study, Green and Griesinger (1996) also used an example of an organization that provides services to people with disabilities. After examining stakeholders' perceptions of the effectiveness of committee practices for the first time, Green and Griesinger (1996) concluded that there is a strong link between board efficiency and organizational efficiency. It established a significant link between the effectiveness of the committee and the effectiveness of the organization when the committee is involved in policy

development, strategic planning, program review, financial planning and control, resource development, development committee. And Dispute Resolution So effective advice improves organizational results.

As a result, Holland and his colleagues have also developed a committee self-assessment tool that supports that effective advice is important for effective organizations. In addition, another study by Green and Griesinger (1996) found that higher-rated organizations have a high-performance board when the board is more contextual, interpersonal, and strategic research (Ostrower & Stone, 2006). In addition, they further identified and identified four aspects of the committee, namely the composition of the board, the relationship between the board and staff, their responsibilities and effectiveness, which have a positive impact on the effectiveness of the organization. Directors influence the effectiveness of the board and the effectiveness of the committee; this can contribute to the overall effectiveness of the organization.

Research conducted by Nobbie and Brudney (2003) presented relationship between board performance and organizational effectiveness in textile sector boards of directors. Data for this research were obtained from three sample categories whereby the first category was 32 textile sector organizations in the United States and Canada. The second category was control sample comprises of 30 textile sector organizations in the US. Third category of sample comprised of board of directors who in the past involved in board development and training activities with National Centre for textile sector organization. The researchers collected data about board performance through the survey feedback from board member, chairman and CEO. Feedback or the perceptions from board member, chairman and CEO in the change of board performance since policy governance model is implemented is gathered to identify potential relationship between the variables.

### **2.3 Marketing Practices**

Findings from the research by (Pope et al., 2009), textile sector organizations that incorporated marketing as one of the skills able to develop brand image for their respective organizations and able to acquire funding, find diverse client market and efficiently use volunteers of the organizations. (Dolnicar & Lazarevski, 2009) found that textile sector organizations could improve the organization's effectiveness through customer-centered marketing strategies. This research also identified customer-centered marketing approach will increase competitive advantage of the organization.

Research conducted by (Tabaku) showed marketing means adopted by textile sector organizations in Albania. Majority of the textile sector organizations' representative agreed that marketing is important for operational efficiency of the textile sector organizations. But in contrast to what they agree, only two organization have a marketing department. These are international organizations that operate from many years in different parts of the globe. Majority of textile sector organizations took part in this study reported that they don't have a marketing plan nor do they work based on a marketing and communications strategy. Even the textile sector organizations that have

marketing face problems such as not properly followed plan, lack of budget, and change in the environment that makes it impossible to follow one particular marketing plan.

Research conducted by (Brady et al., 2011) showed there are several marketing strategies options available to all textile sector organizations that can lead to an increase in organizational performance. This study uses (Bennett & Savani, 2004) study on MARKOR's marketing orientation study to get a better picture of marketing functions in textile sector organizations in Australia. It is clear that larger organizations seem to be more effective performers.

However, research recognizes that textile sector organizations can easily implement some activities to ensure their own performance improves. A key driver in this instance was the annual survey of donors which clearly made a difference to performance and is therefore worth considering in developing new models of operation.

According to the research by (Ejaz et al., 2016; Striebing, 2017), marketing can be measured through marketing performance of a company. The study findings showed marketing performance is good when there is alignment between marketing activities and the investments spent on the business. Besides this, alignment between marketing activities and organizational objectives is an important measurement in marketing. Accountability also shown in this research as an indicator of marketing performance.

Based on the discussion in the problem statement, below is the hypotheses and research framework for the study with three independent variables; transparency, board performance and marketing practices and textile sector organizational effectiveness represent the dependent variable.

**H1:** There is a significant positive relationship between transparency and textile sector organizational effectiveness.

**H2:** There is a significant positive relationship between board performance and textile sector organizational effectiveness.

**H3:** There is a significant positive relationship between marketing practices and textile sector organizational effectiveness.

### **3 Methodology**

For this purpose, we have selected all textile sector organizations which manufacture different products for export purpose. The mentioned population is opted for due to the reason it can provide the needed sample for the current research. Since there are huge number of employees in this sector, therefore an appropriate sampling made to select the survey participants.

The research method includes simple random sampling techniques. In this sampling, of textile sector organizations to be part of the research is selected from the population. Therefore, the uniform work processes are ensuring to be existence in the selected of

textile sector organizations. Results will not be biased or sided to one particular sample and therefore the sampling process is very critical (Silver, 2007).

Based on the principles of simple random sampling technique, each of the textile sector organizations employees is picked purely by chance and randomly. Hence, as per (Krejcie & Morgan, 1970) sample determination table, 377 managers were selected to serve as the sample. The questionnaires are distributed for these selected textile sector organizations to get appropriate responses. To obtain the correct responses through questionnaire the researcher believes that distributing the questionnaire to the staffs at managerial level of the organization would be appropriate to this study.

#### 4 Results

A total of 450 survey questionnaires were distributed to the research target via face-face guided questionnaires. Among the 450 distributed face- face guided questionnaires, there were responses from 386 managers who are working on managerial positions. As such the respond rate for this data collection process was 94%. The quantity 377 is sufficient and valid to be used for analyzing the data using various stages of SPSS. As such data analysis techniques used on these 377 responses are presented in the below sections.

Table 1 Descriptive statistics

	<b>Demographics</b>	<b>Frequency</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
<b>Gender</b>	Male	167	44.3
	Female	210	55.7
<b>Age</b>	20 – 25	69	18.3.0
	26 – 30	93	24.7
	31- 40	164	43.5
	Above 40 years old	51	13.5
<b>Study level</b>	Foundation studies	94	24.9
	Bachelor’s degree	165	43.8
	Master’s degree	100	26.5
	PhD	18	4.8
<b>Position</b>	Manager	156	41.4
	Manager and above	221	58.6
<b>Experience</b>	5 – 10	83	22.0
	11 – 15	91	24.1
	15 – 20	155	41.1
	More than 20	48	12.7

According to the summary shown in table1, majority of the respondents are female staffs with 55.7% of them. The rest of the 44.3% of the sample consists of male staffs. The bigger part of the samples is in the age range 31 to 40 years old. This proportion is 43.5% of the total respondents. The subsequent majority age group is 26 to 30 years old staffs with 24.7% of them. Those in the age group 20 to 25 years old consists of 18.3% of the sample while there is just 13.5% of the respondents belong to the age group above 40 years old.

Majority of respondents are qualified in Bachelor's degree with 37.1% of them. The summary also shows those with foundation studies is next highest majority with 22.3%. Respondents with Master's degree qualification consist of 19.9% of the total respondents while respondents with PhD qualification are 20.7%. Majority of the respondents are holding position as manager and above with 58.6% of them. Most of the respondents have working experience from 15 to 20 years.

Based on the result in table 2, it has revealed that board performance showed the positive relationship with textile sector organizational effectiveness ( $r=0.561$ ,  $p=0.00$ ). Positive correlation coefficient indicated the direct relationship occurred between the variables. Likewise, transparency showed the positive relationship with textile sector organizational effectiveness ( $r=0.870$ ,  $p=0.00$ ). Positive correlation coefficient indicated the direct relationship occurred between the variables. Following this, marketing practices showed the positive relationship with textile sector organizational effectiveness ( $r=0.813$ ,  $p=0.00$ ). Positive correlation coefficient indicated the direct relationship occurred between the variables.

Among the three independent variables, transparency has the strongest association with textile sector organizational effectiveness because the correlation coefficient is 0.870, which is the highest. Following this, the variable marketing practices shows 0.813, correlation coefficient with the dependent variable. Correlation between board performance and textile sector organizational effectiveness is at moderate level. All the correlations between the variables are at significant value lower than 0.05 indicating that the relationship is not from casual.

Table 2 Pearson's correlation analysis

Dependent Variable	Independent variables	Pearson' correlation coefficient	Sig. (2-tailed)
Textile Sector Organizational effectiveness	Board Performance	0.561	0.00
	Transparency	0.870	0.00
	Marketing Practices	0.813	0.00

\*\* . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Regression analysis conducted to create a model that can relate all the three independent variables simultaneously with the dependent variable. Summary of regression analysis shown in table 3. Based on the regression table, the R<sup>2</sup> is recorded as .802 where it shows that the independent variables of the study (board performance, transparency and marketing practices) have 80.2% of variability on the dependent variable (textile sector organization). Based on the results in table 3 of F-Test for overall significance of the model, (502.746, p<.05), this revealed that there is a linear relationship between independent variables and dependent variable. The adjusted R<sup>2</sup> of .800 means that 80% of organizational effectiveness is explained by the variation in board performance, transparency and marketing practices.

Table 3 Regression model

Variables	Unstandardized coefficient	Standard error	t	Sig
Constant	-0.208	0.113	-1.845	0.066
Board Performance	0.305	0.034	9.040	0.000
Transparency	0.748	0.040	18.511	0.000
Marketing Practices	0.031	0.039	0.813	0.417

Table 4 ANOVA

Model	ANOVA <sup>a</sup>				
	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regression	97.795	3	32.598	502.746	.000 <sup>b</sup>
1 Residual	24.185	373	.065		
Total	121.980	376			

a. Dependent Variable: Organizational Effectiveness

b. Predictors: (Constant), Board effectiveness, Transparency, Marketing practices

Table 5 Model summary of the regression analysis

R	R square	Adjusted R square
0.895	0.802	0.800

By combining the outcomes from table 4 and table 5, mathematic model that can contribute 80% towards organization is given as: Organizational Effectiveness = 0.305; Board Performance +0.748; Transparency + 0.031; Marketing Practices = -0.208. Thus, summary of hypothesis testing is given in table 6.



Table 6 Summary of hypothesis testing

Hypothesis	Statement	Decision
<b>H1</b>	There is a significant positive relationship between transparency and textile sector organizational effectiveness.	Supported
<b>H2</b>	There is a significant positive relationship between board performance and textile sector organizational effectiveness.	Supported
<b>H3</b>	There is a significant positive relationship between marketing practices and textile sector organizational effectiveness.	Not Supported

Hypothesis 1 proposed that there is a significant positive relationship between transparency and textile sector organizational effectiveness. Table 6 exhibits that ( $B = 0.748$ ,  $t = 18.511$ ,  $p = 0.00$ ). Hence, Hypothesis 1 was accepted. Hypothesis 2 proposed that there is a significant positive relationship between board performance and textile sector organizational effectiveness. Result in Table 6 exhibits the coefficient = 0.305,  $t = 9.040$ ,  $p = 0.00$  and hence H2 is accepted. Hypothesis 3 proposed that there is a significant positive relationship between marketing practices and textile sector organizational effectiveness. Table 6 exhibited that the coefficient = 0.031,  $t = 0.813$ ,  $p = 0.417$ , due to the ( $P > 0.05$ ) hence, this study does not support H3. Therefore, the result shows that marketing practices does not significantly contribute to the textile sector's organizational effectiveness.

## 5 Discussion of the results

The discussion will be hypothesis oriented whereby it is presented to support the developed hypothesis. There are three hypotheses in this research. Each will be discussed in relation to the findings made via SPSS analysis.

Results showed that transparency will create organizational effectiveness. This result explain that practice of transparency could allow organization to take decision without fearing any protocol. This practice might improve organizational effectiveness through their spontaneous acts. In being transparent, organization do not have any practice to be concealed from their own members or from the public. Since they can present and communicate information as the way it existing, there is possibility of offering service with high effectiveness.

Past researches reviewed in the literature review supported the above finding though different methods and scopes were used in those studies. (Baapogmah, Mayer, Chien, & Afolabi, 2015) showed that transparency act such as financial accountability creates organizational effectiveness. (Liket & Maas, 2015)'s study also supported transparency in financial reporting will improve organization's effectiveness.

The board appeared to have huge responsibility in maintaining organizational effectiveness through their performance. This may include the attributes and efficiency

of board members. Their working skills could create successful projects that the organization can deliver to its clients. Apart from these, the decisions board members make from time to time can increase the organization's effectiveness due to effective decisions. Findings from (Bradshaw et al., 1992) showed that board members' practices such as planning, maintaining common vision and good practices of meeting create board effectiveness and in turn create organization's effectiveness. Even though (Herman & Renz, 2004) found relationship between board effectiveness and overall textile sector organizational effectiveness, there was no further explanation on how this relationship was validated. Similarly, (Green & Griesinger, 1996) discovered strong relationship existed between board performance and organizational effectiveness. (Green & Griesinger, 1996) found that contextual, educational, interpersonal, and strategic characteristics of board created organization's effectiveness.

Marketing practice such as marketing management found to provide organization's effectiveness. However, this was the insignificant relationship compared to the earlier two independent variables. The relationship was strengthened by both the Pearson's correlation coefficient and coefficient in the linear regression model. Based on the values obtained from these two tests, when there is increase in the marketing practices or increase of quality in marketing management, the organization will function with more effectiveness. However, due to the insignificant relationship between marketing and organization's effectiveness, there is no valid ground to make decision that the organization's effectiveness resulted from marketing alone or that it is a casual relationship. Marketing efforts such as creating feasible marketing plan, use relevant marketing materials to communicate and select accurate target to communicate marketing plans.

Past researchers (Dolnicar & Lazarevski, 2009; Pope et al., 2009) supported the findings that textile sector organizations could improve the organization's effectiveness through customer-centered marketing strategies. (Tabaku) also showed that marketing is important for operational efficiency of the textile sector's organizations. Among the findings made by previous authors, (Brady et al., 2011) showed choices of marketing strategies such as annual survey of donors and knowledge generating systems resulted in efficiency of the textile sector organizations

## **6 Research implications**

The research findings implied that marketing practices can improve organizational effectiveness. This could happen due to capability of marketing tool to promote organization, create brand image of it and identification of client needs. Via promotion, more clients will be aware of the organization operation and seek the service. Promoting organization using marketing management could improve effectiveness by creating huge client market. At the same times, clients need to remember an image of the organization in order to seek their service or refer their service to others.

## **7 Limitation of the research and recommendation for future research**

The study limitation is lack of availability to conduct qualitative research whereby an in- depth interview could be done using qualitative method. However, with the time

constraint, this method was not able to be used for data collection process. In-depth interview requires time dedication of both the researcher and the sample because this method of data collection obviously needed face-to-face time between them. Absence of qualitative method is discussed as study limitation because researcher not able to gather justification for each response provided by the respondents. Therefore, the recommendation to improve this study is to implement time management in order to conduct qualitative research. Researcher will be able to understand the reasons for each response gathered during data collection process.

## **8 Conclusion**

The research able to highlights the main variables that will increase textile sector organization's effectiveness. The board performance and transparency were identified as main variables in influencing the textile sector's organizational effectiveness. The results have shown that the board transparency and board performances are positively correlated to organizational effectiveness form context of Pakistan. Findings revealed the important implications for organization to increase their operational effectiveness; the organization has to pay more attentions in operational policies and code of ethics (integrity) in daily operation. Furthermore, the top management of organization shall ensure the board members are performing their duties and aligned with organization's vision and missions. Among the three variables, transparency practice found as the strongest variable for organization's effectiveness followed by board performance and finally marketing practices. Thus, the study recommends organization in Pakistan to improve their transparency work policies and procedures.

**Author Contributions:** All authors contributed equally

**Data Availability Statement:** Data is available from correspondence author on request

**Conflict of Interest:** Authors declared no potential conflict of interest

**Funding Information:** Not applicable

## **References**

- Baapogmah, F. A., Mayer, R., Chien, W.-W., & Afolabi, A. (2015). Control mechanisms and accountability challenges in nonprofit organizations. *Global Journal of Business Research*, 9(1), 27-38.
- Bennett, R., & Sargeant, A. (2005). The nonprofit marketing landscape: guest editors' introduction to a special section. *Journal of Business Research*, 58(6), 797-805.
- Bennett, R., & Savani, S. (2004). Managing conflict between marketing and other functions within charitable organisations. *Leadership and Organization Development Journal*, 25(2), 180-200.
- Bilal, A., & Sial, M. A. (2017). Relationship of personality traits with absorption capacity: a case of water and power development authority Pakistan. *Oman Chapter of Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 34(82), 1-8.

- Bradshaw, P., Murray, V., & Wolpin, J. (1992). Do nonprofit boards make a difference? An exploration of the relationships among board structure, process, and effectiveness. *Nonprofit and voluntary sector quarterly*, 21(3), 227-249.
- Brady, E., Brace-Govan, J., Brennan, L., & Conduit, J. (2011). Market orientation and marketing in nonprofit organizations. Indications for fundraising from Victoria. *International journal of nonprofit and voluntary sector marketing*, 16(1), 84-98.
- Chen, J. Y., Lakhmani, S. G., Stowers, K., Selkowitz, A. R., Wright, J. L., & Barnes, M. (2018). Situation awareness-based agent transparency and human-autonomy teaming effectiveness. *Theoretical issues in ergonomics science*, 19(3), 259-282.
- Dolnicar, S., & Lazarevski, K. (2009). Methodological reasons for the theory/practice divide in market segmentation. *Journal of Marketing Management*, 25(3-4), 357-373.
- Ejaz, N., Naeem, U. A., Shahmim, M. A., Elahi, A., & Khan, N. (2016). Environmental impacts of small dams on agriculture and ground water development: A case study of Khanpur dam, Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Engineering and Applied Sciences*.
- Gandia, J. L. (2011). Internet disclosure by nonprofit organizations: Empirical evidence of nongovernmental organizations for development in Spain. *Nonprofit and voluntary sector quarterly*, 40(1), 57-78.
- Green, J. C., & Griesinger, D. W. (1996). Board performance and organizational effectiveness in nonprofit social services organizations. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 6(4), 381-402.
- Greiling, D., Harris, M., & Stanley, R. (2016). Accountability in non-profit organizations introduction to the symposium. *Public Administration Quarterly*, 212-219.
- Heimstädt, M., & Dobusch, L. (2020). Transparency and accountability: Causal, critical and constructive perspectives. *Organization Theory*, 1(4), 2631787720964216.
- Herman, R. D., & Renz, D. O. (2004). Doing things right: Effectiveness in local nonprofit organizations, a panel study. *Public Administration Review*, 64(6), 694-704.
- Ijaz, M. W., Mahar, R. B., Siyal, A. A., & Anjum, M. N. (2018). Geospatial analysis of creeks evolution in the Indus Delta, Pakistan using multi sensor satellite data. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science*, 200, 324-334.
- Krejcie, R. V., & Morgan, D. W. (1970). Determining sample size for research activities. *Educational and psychological measurement*, 30(3), 607-610.
- Lee, R. W. (2016). Adherence to accounting best practices in small community not-for-profit organizations: Northcentral University.
- Liket, K. C., & Maas, K. (2015). Nonprofit organizational effectiveness: Analysis of best practices. *Nonprofit and voluntary sector quarterly*, 44(2), 268-296.
- Murtaza, G., Shad, I., Shahzad, K., Shah, M. K., & Khan, N. A. (2011). Impact of distributive and procedural justice on employees' commitment: A case of public sector organization of Pakistan. *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences*, 29, 73-80.
- Nobbie, P. D., & Brudney, J. L. (2003). Testing the implementation, board performance, and organizational effectiveness of the policy governance model in nonprofit boards of directors. *Nonprofit and voluntary sector quarterly*, 32(4), 571-595.
- Ostrower, F., & Stone, M. M. (2006). *Governance: Research trends, gaps, and future prospects*. The nonprofit sector: A research handbook (pp. 612-628): Yale University Press.
- Pope, J. A., Isely, E. S., & Asamoah-Tutu, F. (2009). Developing a marketing strategy for nonprofit organizations: An exploratory study. *Journal of Nonprofit & public sector marketing*, 21(2), 184-201.
- Samuels, D. (2021). Government procurement and changes in firm transparency. *The Accounting Review*, 96(1), 401-430.

- Silver, J. B. (2007). *Mosquito ecology: field sampling methods*: springer science & business media.
- Striebing, C. (2017). Professionalization and voluntary transparency practices in nonprofit organizations. *Nonprofit Management and Leadership*, 28(1), 65-83.
- Tabaku, E. Mersini (Zerellari), M.(2013). An Overview of marketing means used by non-profit organizations: a detailed overview of NPOs operating in the district of Elbasan. *Journal of Marketing and Management*, 4(2), 78-95.
- Villena, V. H., & Dhanorkar, S. (2020). How institutional pressures and managerial incentives elicit carbon transparency in global supply chains. *Journal of operations management*, 66(6), 697-734.